

**ADVANCED SUBSIDIARY GCE
 CRITICAL THINKING**

**F492/01
 F492/02**

UNIT 2: Assessing & Developing Argument

MONDAY 14 JANUARY 2008

Afternoon

Time: 1 hour 45 minutes

Candidates answer on the question paper.

Additional materials: Answer Sheet for Section A Multiple Choice
 Resource Booklet



Candidate Forename

Candidate Surname

Centre Number

Candidate Number

INSTRUCTIONS TO CANDIDATES

- Write your name in capital letters, your Centre Number and Candidate Number in the boxes above and on the Answer Sheet.
- Read each question carefully and make sure that you know what you have to do before starting your answer.
- Answer **all** the questions.
- Answer Section A, questions 1–20, on the Answer Sheet provided. You are advised to spend not more than 40 minutes on Section A.
- Answer Sections B and C in the spaces on the question paper.
- Read the Resource Booklet and each question carefully and make sure you know what you have to do before starting your answer.

INFORMATION FOR CANDIDATES

- The number of marks for each question is given in brackets [] at the end of each question or part question.
- The total number of marks for this paper is **120**. Section A comprises 33% of the available marks; Sections B and C comprise 67% of the available marks.
- Up to 5 marks are available for quality of written communication in Sections B and C.

For Examiner's Use	
Section B /50	
Section C /25	
QWC/5	
Total	

This document consists of **20** printed pages.

Section A: Multiple Choice

Answer **all** questions in this section of the paper.

You are advised to spend no more than 40 minutes on this section of the paper.

- 1 Why did we spend £1.5 billion last year on bottled water? You would have thought that tap water being so cheap (£2 would buy enough drinking water for 3 years) would overcome the influence of the glossy adverts and fancy shaped bottles. However, the low cost of tap water is the problem. In a consumer society, low cost is associated with poor value. So the reason that we buy bottled water is not because it tastes better or is more pure, but because, and only because, it is so expensive.

Which of the following is the **best statement** of the **main conclusion** of the above argument?

- A The low cost of tap water compared to bottled water makes it very unappealing to consumers.
- B A fancy shaped bottle is very unlikely to be the reason for the popularity of bottled water.
- C It is only the high cost of bottled water that convinces consumers to buy bottled water.
- D The high cost of bottled water is one of many factors in convincing consumers to buy bottled water. [1]

- 2 Top footballers earn millions a year whilst referees earn only a tiny fraction of this. When these footballers make mistakes, it is easily forgotten and forgiven, despite their huge salaries and endless hours of training. It is unreasonable to expect referees to have higher standards when they are less well trained and have to deal with players who seem so willing to cheat. It is unfair that referees receive so much criticism when they make a mistake.

Which of the following, if true, would **most strengthen** the above argument?

- A The skill required to be a referee is far less than that required to be a top footballer.
- B The mistakes made by referees are very unlikely to affect the outcome of a game.
- C The winning team in important matches is usually the one that makes fewer mistakes.
- D The mistakes made by referees frequently affect the outcome of important matches. [1]

- 3 The higher temperatures of recent years have given us occasional hose-pipe bans and sun-stroke but few other problems. Next time we complain of being too hot we should consider the plight of the poor buff-tailed bumble bee. The warmer days now mean that they have to work much harder as they begin foraging for food 3 weeks earlier than 30 years ago. They also do not rest until late December and have to go through the huge task of producing an extra generation of bees in the autumn. Numerous other insect species will have been similarly affected.

Which of the following is the **conclusion that can best be drawn** from the above passage?

- A Hotter days have led to an increase in the number of bees in this country.
- B Insects have adapted to warmer temperatures more quickly than humans.
- C Humans should stop complaining about the hotter days of recent years.
- D The hotter days of recent years have affected insects more than humans. [1]

- 4 The alleged joy of alcohol-induced euphoria may soon be achievable through a cocktail of drugs that mimic the effects of alcohol on the brain. The drugs could create the relaxation and sociability that people enjoy without any of the aggression or sickness that alcohol causes. Even better, long term liver damage would also be avoided. This is good news, particularly as claims that moderate alcohol intake is good for us are increasingly being shown to be wrong.

Which of the following, if true, would **most weaken** the above argument?

- A The effect of the new drugs only lasts for a few minutes.
- B There are few, if any, major side effects with the new drugs.
- C The new drugs are addictive and have many side effects.
- D There has been no long term testing of the new drugs. [1]

- 5 The success of CDs released by groups of operatic tenors might be taken as a sign of their musical quality. However, the 'three tenors', high in the charts in March 2007, may not be popular for their music. It seems more likely to be an effect of Mother's Day (March 18th) gift buying, when the packaging and pictures of 3 men in smart suits may have been the factors that triggered purchases. The success of operatic tenors is down to image more than musical talent.

Which of the following is an **underlying assumption** of the above argument?

- A Most mothers are attracted to men in smart suits.
- B Some children are able to judge the type of man that their mother is attracted to.
- C Most children think that their mothers like classical music.
- D Many children think that their mothers will find men in smart suits appealing. [1]

- 6 A test group of HIV positive patients who believed that 'God loved them' were found to lose vital immune system cells at one third the rate of a control group. The control group were receiving similar drug treatments, but didn't believe in God. It may not be possible to infer that God's love is curing these patients, but it is reasonable to infer that a feeling of being loved and valued is helping them fight the disease. Anything that helps somebody cope with illness and disease must be a good thing.

Which of the following is the **conclusion that can best be drawn** from the above passage?

- A It would be beneficial to express our love to our friends when they are ill.
- B Patients who do not experience the love of friends will not recover as quickly as those who do.
- C Patients' attitudes are more important to their recovery than medical treatments.
- D We should encourage all patients to have strong beliefs in order to help them through illness.

[1]

- 7 The possible closure of some of our most famous cathedral choirs is sad news. These choirs have been part of our cultural heritage for hundreds of years and have given many generations of worshippers great pleasure. They have also acted as nurseries for some very talented musicians as well as ensuring the continuing popularity of some great English choral composers. Closure would therefore have a significant impact on the musical life of this country.

Which of the following is the **best statement** of the **main conclusion** of the above argument?

- A Famous cathedral choirs have ensured the popularity of some great English composers.
- B The closure of famous cathedral choirs will have significant consequences.
- C It is sad news that some famous cathedral choirs may close.
- D The possible closure of famous cathedral choirs will end centuries of pleasure for worshippers.

[1]

- 8 Despite the Government's wishes that we should all work longer, many employers continue to sack staff when they reach 65. Although this might be thought of as ageist, increasing age can have an impact on the ability to carry out work: doctors are an example. The poor eyesight and failing physical co-ordination of the over 65s means that they will be putting patients at risk, particularly in surgical cases. We should continue to support employers who want to sack staff at 65.

Which of the following is the **best statement** of the **flaw** in the above argument?

- A It is not possible to generalise from surgeons to all doctors.
- B It is not possible to generalise to all areas of employment from doctors.
- C Some 65 year olds may not have poor eyesight and failing physical co-ordination.
- D Some employers may not want to sack their staff when they reach 65.

[1]

- 9 There is a widespread belief amongst parents that playing Mozart to young babies will make them academically more able. Sadly, this view was based on a misinterpretation of research findings, which suggested no such link. Playing other varieties of classical music to children will also not increase intelligence. This shows that there are no short cuts to good academic results. Parents desperate for clever children will have to persuade their children to work hard at school.

Which of the following is the **best statement** of the **main conclusion** of the above argument?

- A Parents are wrong to believe that playing Mozart to babies increases intelligence.
- B Parents should stop playing classical music to their children.
- C Parents should realise that working hard at school is the only way to have clever children.
- D Parents who want clever children will need to encourage them to work hard at school. [1]

- 10 It is unacceptable that hospital visitors should have to pay to park at hospitals. Hospitals are now using parking as an easy way to earn more money. Visitors have no choice about where they park, allowing hospitals to charge whatever they like. Prices are often excessively high. Most visitors are a welcome distraction for a patient staying in hospital and do much to aid their recovery. High prices may prevent these visits.

Which of the following, if true, would **most weaken** the above argument?

- A Income from hospital car parks has remained unchanged for several years .
- B Hospitals can only build new car parks to meet demand by charging for parking.
- C There are examples of hospitals that continue to offer free parking for visitors.
- D Some hospital car parks are built and operated by private companies. [1]

- 11 The quiet, reserved atmosphere of libraries has been shattered recently by an explosion of children's story groups, beeping computers and interactive audio-visual displays. No doubt librarians feel that this will increase the numbers through their doors and ensure the long-term survival of libraries. The reality is that most older people – the group most likely to read and borrow books – no longer feel welcome and stay away. These changes can only hasten the decline of the few libraries that we have left.

Which of the following, if true, would **most strengthen** the above argument?

- A The number of books borrowed from libraries has decreased rapidly recently.
- B There has always been a wide selection of books in libraries aimed at children.
- C The number of books borrowed from libraries has changed little in recent years.
- D Book lending remains a significant part of libraries' work. [1]

- 12 For centuries, the majority of parents have wanted boys. However, girls now get better academic grades and are more likely to go to university. The subsequent increase in female employment is responsible for economic growth in most developed countries and women's long term earning potential outstrips their male counterparts. Girls are, therefore, a better investment for parents as they are more likely to be able to provide for their parents when they are old. It seems likely that girls will soon become the preference of most parents.

Which of the following is an **underlying assumption** of the above argument?

- A Parents' previous preference for boys was not related to their earning potential.
- B Parents' previous preference for boys was based only on their long term earning potential.
- C Parents' previous preference for boys was based mainly on their long term earning potential.
- D Parents' previous preference for boys was due to legal differences in the status of men and women. [1]

- 13 It might be thought that having a baby as a teenager would be the end of many girls' careers. However, we should not underestimate the motivational effect of motherhood. Many teenage mums have benefited from dedicated mother and baby education centres and, as a result, have set their sights on professional careers. Given that many teenage mothers come from the lowest income families this is surely good news and means that we do not need to worry quite so much about the many teenage girls that become pregnant each year.

Which of the following is an **underlying assumption** of the above argument?

- A The teenage mums referred to generally achieved their career ambitions.
- B Financial issues are the main reason for concern about teenage mums.
- C The teenage mums who benefit from mother and baby centres are all from low income families.
- D Having a baby makes many teenage mums want a better career. [1]

- 14 Can any work of art be worth £50 million? In the sense of 'worth' meaning cost, clearly works of art are worth that amount, as somebody is willing to pay it. However, in a more important sense of worth, it is more difficult to say. To answer this question, each work would need to be evaluated on issues such as the quality of the workmanship, the impact on those who look at it and whether it has lasting appeal. Given the varied views of everyone who looks at art this would be a difficult and unreliable process.

Which of the following is the **best statement** of the **main conclusion** of the above argument?

- A It is impossible to judge the worth of a work of art costing millions of pounds.
- B A work of art costing millions of pounds is worth what someone is willing to pay for it.
- C There are many different opinions about the worth of a work of art costing millions of pounds.
- D It is difficult to reach a decision about the worth of a work of art costing millions of pounds.

[1]

- 15 Young people express appreciation at a gig by whistling and cheering. It is not surprising, therefore, that so few young people go to classical concerts. At these, anything other than polite applause is frowned upon. If we do not allow young people to express themselves at classical concerts, they will continue to stay away, audience numbers will dwindle, and ultimately classical concerts will stop altogether. This will result in thousands of unemployed classical musicians and the closure of our famous music schools, not to mention the irreparable damage to Britain's cultural life.

Which of the following is the **best statement** of the **flaw** in the above argument?

- A Poor behaviour at classical concerts cannot be justified by other negatives such as irreparable cultural damage.
- B The attitudes of classical audiences are deliberately misrepresented in order to support an argument about cultural damage.
- C There are no statistics to show that young people do not go to classical concerts.
- D It is unreasonable to jump from the lack of whistling and cheering at classical concerts to irreparable cultural damage.

[1]

- 16 The number of ASBOs issued in previously industrial areas is much higher than in country areas. For instance, 554 ASBOs have been issued in the West Midlands compared to only 32 in rural Wiltshire. Anti-social behaviour is a significant problem for police and local communities. Given that we have a limited number of police, we must shift our police resources from country areas to previously industrial areas.

Which of the following, if true, would **most weaken** the above argument?

- A There are already fewer police in country areas than in previously industrial areas.
 - B There are regional differences in the way that police forces interpret the rules for issuing ASBOs.
 - C There are still some areas of the West Midlands that have a mainly industrial economy.
 - D The populations of the West Midlands and Wiltshire are not significantly different. [1]
- 17 Cars of the future will be able to run on water. Just as in a GCSE chemistry experiment, the water will react with boron to make hydrogen, which is then used to power the car. The waste products will be water and boron oxide, a safe solid that can then be turned back into boron. Not only is this an ideal environmental solution for our cars, it is also a sustainable fuel source for the long term future. We can look forward to many years of 'green' motoring without having to use petrol.

Which of the following is an **underlying assumption** of the above argument?

- A Converting boron oxide into boron produces less pollution than running a car on petrol.
- B There are enough supplies of boron to enable cars to run on water for many centuries.
- C The technology needed to turn boron oxide back into boron is no more complicated than a GCSE chemistry experiment.
- D More environmentally friendly methods of running a car will not be found in the foreseeable future. [1]

- 18 There is an argument that we should eat more vegetables containing anti-oxidants as they eliminate harmful free-radicals in our bodies. However, this is based on observational studies rather than properly controlled scientific experiments. After all, the people who were observed, that ate more vegetables and lived longer, may have been just the type of people who have generally healthy lifestyles. This means that findings based on observational studies cannot be relied upon. Free-radicals can also be helpful to our bodies as they kill bacteria. So, we should, at the very least, question the value of including more anti-oxidants in our diets.

Which of the following is the **best statement** of the **intermediate conclusion** of the above argument?

- A We should eat more vegetables containing anti-oxidants in order to eliminate harmful free-radicals.
 - B Evidence from observational studies in favour of eating more vegetables may be unreliable.
 - C We should probably question the value of including more anti-oxidants in our diets.
 - D There may be other reasons why people who eat a lot of vegetables live longer. [1]
- 19 A British Crime Survey shows that between 1995 and 2006 recorded crime fell by a very significant 44%. It also found that the chance of being a victim of crime was at its lowest level since 1981. It is therefore strange that so many people questioned in opinion polls believe that crime related to anti-social behaviour and disorder in public places is a very big problem. The only possible conclusion is that the public's worries about high levels of crime continue to be based far more on media hype and high profile cases than the actual incidence of crime in their area.

Which of the following is **NOT** an **underlying assumption** of the above argument?

- A There has not been any significant change in the way crime is recorded or defined between 1995 and 2006.
- B The majority of those questioned in polls are aware of the contents of the British Crime Survey.
- C British Crime Survey figures would include crimes related to anti-social behaviour and disorder in public places.
- D Those questioned in opinion polls are representative of the majority of the population. [1]

- 20** It is very difficult for countries to compete in global markets without using English – the world’s business language. Time and time again evidence has shown that adopting the use of English is connected to economic growth and wealth. Take China as an example. About 20% of the country is now learning English and as a result they have accessed new markets and are now one of the world’s leading economic superpowers. Many countries could solve their economic difficulties by following China’s example of encouraging the learning of English.

Which of the following is the **best statement** of the **flaw** in the above argument?

- A** Most people in China do not speak English as 20% is only a small proportion of the population.
- B** It is not possible to generalise from the isolated example of China’s economic growth.
- C** Speaking English might be necessary for economic growth but is very unlikely to be enough to guarantee it.
- D** South Korea is economically successful despite having a very low proportion of English speakers.

[1]

Section B: Analysing and evaluating argument

Read Document 1, 'Child of our time', and answer questions 21 to 32.

In questions 21, 22 and 23 you are asked to identify parts of the argument presented to you in 'Child of our time'. In your answers use the author's exact wording as far as possible.

21 Identify the main conclusion of the argument presented in the passage.

.....
..... [2]

22 Identify **four** reasons that are given to support the conclusion.

1 [2]
.....

2 [2]
.....

3 [2]
.....

4 [2]
.....

23 Identify the counter argument in the passage.

Reason

.....
..... [2]
.....

Conclusion

.....
..... [2]
.....

24 In paragraph 2 the author suggests that the increasing numbers of women in work is a result of greater equality of the sexes.

(a) Give one other explanation for this increase.

.....
.....
..... [1]

(b) What would we need to assume about the types of job that women have been taking up since the 1970s, to support the idea of greater equality of the sexes?

.....
.....
.....
..... [2]

(c) Assess how well evidence of an increase from 60% to 70% supports the author's reasoning about women moving from the domestic sphere to the world of education and work.

Circle your decision:

Strongly supports reasoning. Weakly supports reasoning.

Explain your decision

.....
.....
.....
..... [2]

25 (a) Name or describe **one** flaw in the author's reasoning in paragraph 3.

.....
..... [1]

(b) With reference to the text, explain why the author's reasoning in paragraph 3 is flawed. You must clearly show why there is a problem with the author's reasoning.

.....
.....
.....
..... [3]

26 In paragraph 4, the author uses the fact that only 28% of teenage mums are in education to suggest that they are facing a 'bleak future'. Suggest one weakness in the way that the author has used this evidence.

.....
..... [2]

27 In paragraph 5, the author uses an average figure of £140,000 to represent the high cost of bringing up a child. Give one strength **or** one weakness in the way that the author has used this evidence.

.....
..... [2]

28 From paragraph 5 give one possible explanation for the rise in the number of children over the age of 30 living at home.

.....
..... [1]

29 (a) At the end of paragraph 5, the author argues that children will become totally dependent on their parents. Name or describe the flaw in the author's reasoning.

.....
..... [1]

(b) With reference to the text, explain why the author's reasoning at the end of paragraph 5 is flawed. You must clearly show why there is a problem with the author's reasoning.

.....
.....
.....
.....
..... [3]

30 Identify **one** example of hypothetical reasoning used by the author in the passage.

.....
.....
..... [1]

31 Suggest one possible inconsistency in paragraph 1.

.....
.....
..... [2]

32 Suggest one general principle that would support the author's reasoning in paragraph 4.

.....
.....
..... [2]

Read Document 2, 'The only child', and answer questions 33 to 36.

33 The author argues that the negative stereotypes associated with only children are incorrect.

Describe two ways that the author supports this argument.

1
.....
..... [2]

2
.....
..... [2]

34 The author seeks to dismiss the theories put forward by Alfred Adler.

(a) Suggest one weakness in the reasoning behind this dismissal.

.....
.....
..... [2]

(b) Using information in paragraph 1, give one alternative reason why we might be able to dismiss the theory of Alfred Adler.

.....
.....
..... [2]

35 In order to argue that an only child is bound to get more attention from its parents, what would we need to assume about these parents compared to parents with several children?

.....
.....
..... [2]

36 The author describes a 'common sense' link between academic achievement and the amount of attention from parents.

(a) Does the author want us to view this link as correlational or causal?

..... [1]

(b) What would we need to assume to support this suggested link?

.....
.....
..... [2]

Total marks for Section B [50] marks

Section C: Developing your own arguments

Questions 37 to 39 refer to Document 1, 'Child of our time'.

- 37** Write a very short argument consisting of two reasons and a conclusion to show that there may not be a rise in teenage pregnancies as a result of a pro-baby message.

Reason

.....
.....

Reason

.....
.....

Conclusion

.....
..... [2+2+1]

Turn over for questions 38 and 39.

PLEASE DO NOT WRITE ON THIS PAGE

Permission to reproduce items where third-party owned material protected by copyright is included has been sought and cleared where possible. Every reasonable effort has been made by the publisher (OCR) to trace copyright holders, but if any items requiring clearance have unwittingly been included, the publisher will be pleased to make amends at the earliest possible opportunity.

OCR is part of the Cambridge Assessment Group. Cambridge Assessment is the brand name of University of Cambridge Local Examinations Syndicate (UCLES), which is itself a department of the University of Cambridge.